



www.cityofvallejo.net

AGENDA
SURVEILLANCE ADVISORY
BOARD
SPECIAL MEETING
6:00 P.M.

Council Chambers

September 06, 2022

Naomi Yun

(Chair)

Andrea Sorce

(Vice Chair)

Michael McMillan

Philip Balbuena

Brooke Reddell

Adam Bregenzar

Lisa Chen

NOTICE: Members of the public will be able to participate in-person or remotely via Zoom. City Hall and the Council Chambers will be open to members of the public 30 minutes prior to the start of the meeting.

IMPORTANT NOTICE

This AGENDA contains a brief general description of each item to be considered. The posting of the recommended actions does not indicate what action may be taken. If comments come to the Surveillance Advisory Board without prior notice for an item not listed on the AGENDA, no specific answers or responses should be expected at this meeting per State law.

Pursuant to Government Code Section 54954.3 of the Brown Act, members of the public shall be afforded the opportunity to speak on any agenda item of interest to them after being recognized by the presiding officer. Members of the public wishing to be so recognized are requested to submit a completed speaker card to the Secretary of the Surveillance Advisory Board prior to the consideration of the item or raise their hand via ZOOM: <https://ZoomRegular.Cityofvallejo.net> or by phone: Dial (669) 900-6833. Enter Meeting ID: 914 0075 0676#. Press * 9 to digitally raise your hand from the phone. For additional instructions on how to speak remotely during public comment, please visit www.cityofvallejo.net/publiccomment. In person speakers will be recognized first.

Notice of Availability of Public Records: All public records relating to an open session item, which are not exempt from disclosure pursuant to the Public Records Act, that are distributed to a majority of the Surveillance Advisory Board will be available on the City of Vallejo website at www.cityofvallejo.net subject to staff's ability to post the documents prior to the meeting.

NOTICE: Members of the Public will be able to participate in-person or remotely via Zoom. City Hall and the Council Chambers will be open to members of the public 30 minutes prior to the start of the meeting.

PUBLIC COMMENT: Members of the Public may provide public comments during the City Council Meeting in person or via ZOOM (<https://ZoomRegular.Cityofvallejo.net>), or via phone, by dialing (669) 900-6833. Meeting ID 914 0075 0676#

For additional instructions on how to speak remotely during public comment, please visit, www.cityofvallejo.net/publiccomment

VIEW THE MEETING:

There are four different ways you can view this public meeting:

- In Person
- Watch Comcast local channel 28 & AT&T Channel 99
- Stream from the City website: www.cityofvallejo.net/Streaming
- Join the Zoom webinar: <https://ZoomRegular.Cityofvallejo.net>

If you have any questions regarding any of the following agenda items, please call the Surveillance Advisory Board Secretary at (707) 648-5200.



The Council Chambers in City Hall is ADA compliant. Devices for the hearing impaired are available from the City Clerk. Requests for disability related modifications or accommodations, aids or services may be made by a person with a disability to the City Clerk's office no less than 72 hours prior to the meeting as required by Section 202 of the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990 and the federal rules and regulations adopted in implementation thereof.

1. CALL TO ORDER

2. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

3. ROLL CALL

4. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

5. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES

A. July 13, 2022 – Special Meeting

6. REPORT OF THE BOARD SECRETARY

7. CITY ATTORNEY REPORT

8. REPORT OF THE CITY COUNCIL LIAISON

9. ACTION ITEMS

A. CONSIDERATION OF ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY OF VALLEJO
SURVEILLANCE ADVISORY BOARD RECOMMENDING AGAINST DEPLOYMENT OF
THE FLOCK GUNSHOT DETECTION SYSTEM

Recommendation: Adopt a resolution recommending against deployment of the Flock
Gunshot Detection System as requested by the Chief of Police and as directed by the
Board at the July 13, 2022 meeting.

Contact: Randy J. Risner, Chief Assistant City Attorney; 707-648-4548;
randy.risner@cityofvallejo.net

B. CONSIDERATION OF ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY OF VALLEJO
SURVEILLANCE ADVISORY BOARD RECOMMENDING THAT THE CITY COUNCIL
MODIFY THE CODIFIED MEETING SCHEDULE FOR THE BOARD

Recommendation: Consider various meeting date options and make a recommendation to
the City Council to modify the meeting dates currently codified in the City of Vallejo
Municipal Code.

Contact: Naveed Ashraf, Chief Innovation officer; 707-648-4468;
naveed.ashraf@cityofvallejo.net

10. REPORT OF THE CHAIRPERSON AND MEMBERS OF THE BOARD

11. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

1. Drone Policy

-
2. Invite a representative from the Police Department to provide and update on the following:
 - a. New technologies and policies
 - b. New proposed Police Department Surveillance items, data, and analysis.
 3. List of current deployed technologies, cost, length of deployment, and impact of technology.
 4. Discuss Municipal Code 2.27.030 Section E. (Emergency Deployment of Technology)

5. ADJOURNMENT

I, Naveed Ashraf, Surveillance Advisory Board Executive Secretary, do hereby certify that I have caused a true copy of the above notice and agenda to be delivered to each of the members of the Surveillance Advisory Board, at the time and in the manner prescribed by law and that this agenda was posted at City Hall, 555 Santa Clara Street, CA at 5:00 p.m., Wednesday August 31, 2022..

Dated: August 31, 2022,



Chief Innovation Officer & IT Director

**SURVEILLANCE ADVISORY BOARD
SPECIAL MEETING MINUTES**

JULY 13, 2022

**Council Chambers
555 Santa Clara Street, Vallejo, California**

DRAFT

1. CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order at 6:00 p.m.

2. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

3. ROLL CALL

Present: Boardmembers Balbuena, Bregenzer, Chen, McMillan, Reddell, Sorce, and Yun

Absent: None

Staff present: Secretary Ashraf, Chief Assistant City Attorney Risner and City Clerk Abrahamson

4. COMMUNITY FORUM – None.

5. CONSENT CALENDAR AND APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

Action: *Moved by Boardmember Bregenzer, seconded by Boardmember Reddell and carried unanimously to approve the Agenda.*

A. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – for special Board meeting of June 9, 2022 and the regular meeting of June 29, 2022

Actions: *(1) Moved by Boardmember Bregenzer, seconded by Boardmember Reddell and carried to adopt the minutes of the June 9, 2022 special meeting (Abstain – Sorce).*

(2) Moved by Boardmember Chen, seconded by Vice Chair Sorce and carried unanimously to approve the minutes of the June 29, 2022 regular meeting.

6. REPORT OF THE BOARD SECRETARY

Secretary Ashraf reported Rachel Ferguson was hired as the City's Human Resources Director and started on July 5.

7. CITY ATTORNEY REPORT – None.

8. REPORT OF THE CITY COUNCIL LIAISON – None.

9. ACTION ITEMS

A. Review the use of a Flock Gun Shot Detection System as a Beta test and the policy

Deputy Police Chief Ta provided an overview of the staff report.

Hector Soliman-Valdez (Flock Safety) recapped previous discussion points as provided by Deputy Chief Ta.

Staff and Mr. Soliman-Valdez responded to questions from Boardmembers. Boardmembers provided comment

Speakers: Joey Porter

Another question and answer period followed with Boardmembers providing comment.

Action: *Moved by Vice Chair Sorce, seconded by Boardmember Balbuena and carried to recommend not participating in the Beta test at this time and wait until further data about the system is available (Ayes – Balbuena, Bregenzer, McMillan, Reddell, and Sorce; Noes – Yun and Chen).*

Chief Assistant City Attorney Risner recommended allowing staff to return to the Board with a resolution for its consideration and adoption later that would memorialize the Commission's concerns that would be shared with the City Council. Boardmembers were asked to send their thoughts to Chief Assistant City Attorney Risner who would draft something that would be presented to the Board at an upcoming meeting.

A discussion followed regarding the process in terms of memorializing concerns to share with the Council, which included the following:

- No hard data – no metrics to confidentially recommend the system to Council
- Data from similar city – full implementation as Priority 1
- Changes to policy around reporting as false positive
- Policy does not include difference in time, privacy, and data retention policy
- Constraints on police officer
- Cost – staff – resources
- Prioritization of calls and response
- Escalation

B. Discussion of Future Agenda Items to be placed on the agenda for board's discussion and prioritization of items.

Secretary Ashraf outlined the future agenda items as requested by Boardmembers. Frequency of board meetings and adoption of a resolution memorializing the Boards concerns related to the Flock Gun Shot Detection System given higher priority and will return to the Board at its next meeting.

Action: *Following discussion, it was moved by Vice Chair Sorce, seconded by Boardmember Reddell and carried unanimously to include all items on future meeting agendas for discussion.*

10. REPORT OF THE CHAIRPERSON AND MEMBERS OF THE BOARD

11. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

Secretary Ashraf reiterated frequency of board meetings and adoption of a resolution memorializing the Boards concerns related to the Flock Gun Shot Detection System would be placed on the Board's next meeting agenda.

The list of current deployed technologies, cost, length of deployment, and impact of technology will be accomplished by a comprehensive memo to the Board. If not sufficient, a deeper dive could follow.

12. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 8:47 p.m.

NAOMI YUN, CHAIR

ATTEST:

NAVEED ASHRAF
CHIEF INNOVATION OFFICER/IT DIRECTOR

RESOLUTION NO. _____

**A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY OF VALLEJO SURVEILLANCE ADVISORY BOARD
RECOMMENDING AGAINST DEPLOYMENT OF THE FLOCK GUNSHOT DETECTION
SYSTEM**

WHEREAS, the City Council of the City of Vallejo created the Surveillance Advisory Board (the “SAB”) by adopting Chapter 2.27 of the Vallejo Municipal Code (the “Code”); and

WHEREAS, the purpose of the SAB is to review and advise the City Council, City Manager and City Departments concerning the acquisition, deployment and use of surveillance technology within the City of Vallejo (the “City”); and

WHEREAS, section 2.27.030D of the Code requires a City Department head to submit requests for review to the SAB of surveillance technology desired to be deployed in the City; and

WHEREAS, the Chief of Police has submitted a request to review the use of the Flock Gunshot Detection System as a beta test within the City of Vallejo; and

WHEREAS, the SAB has 45 days from the date of the request to issue a recommendation to the City Council, the City Manager and the Chief of Police; and

WHEREAS, the SAB has reviewed the staff report and other materials submitted to the SAB by the Chief of Police; and

WHEREAS, the SAB has considered the presentations and statements of the Chief of Police, the Deputy Chief and representatives of Flock Safety concerning the propose Gunshot Detection System.

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVOED AS FOLLOWS:

1. The SAB hereby recommends that the City not deploy the Flock Gunshot Detection System for the following reasons:
 - a. There are currently no hard metrics and data about the effectiveness of this technology;
 - b. There are no clear measures of success versus failure for the proposed beta test of the system;
 - c. There is likely to be an increase in staff/officer time because the system may produce additional calls for service at a time when the Vallejo Police Department is significantly understaffed;
 - d. The proposed policy fails to address the possibility of escalation when officers arrive on scene expecting active shooters after receiving a notification from the system;
 - e. There are significant concerns about data retention and privacy that need to be addressed before any such system is deployed.
2. Although the SAB does not recommend deployment of this technology at this time, the SAB acknowledges the need to address gun violence in the City and the potential of new technologies to assist with this important issue.

3. If the City determines that it will proceed with the deployment of the Gunshot Detection System, the SAB requests that it be allowed to provide recommendations and input on the proposed policy for use of the system.
4. The SAB is not entirely against the use of such technology and is willing to reconsider its use at a later date provided its concerns are addressed. If the City reconsiders this technology in the future, the SAB suggests that it only be deployed if there is available peer-reviewed data showing the effectiveness of the system. Further, the City should consider the impact that the deployment will have on the minimal resources currently available to the City such as the additional staff and officer time that will be required.

Adopted by the Surveillance Advisory Board of the City of Vallejo at a Special Meeting held on August 3, 2022 with the following vote:

AYES:

NOES:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

NAOMI YUN, CHAIR

ATTEST:

NAVEED ASHRAF, SECRETARY

RESOLUTION NO. _____

**A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY OF VALLEJO SURVEILLANCE ADVISORY BOARD
RECOMMENDING THAT THE CITY COUNCIL MODIFY THE MEETING SCHEDULE FOR
THE SURVEILLANCE ADVISORY BOARD**

WHEREAS, the City Council of the City of Vallejo created the Surveillance Advisory Board (the “SAB”) by adopting Chapter 2.27 of the Vallejo Municipal Code (the “Code”); and

WHEREAS, the purpose of the SAB is to review and advise the City Council, City Manager and City Departments concerning the acquisition, deployment and use of surveillance technology within the City of Vallejo (the “City”); and

WHEREAS, section 2.27.060 of the Code designates the third Thursday of every other month beginning the first full month after adoption of the ordinance; and

WHEREAS, a conflict currently exists with the meeting schedules of other advisory boards; and

WHEREAS, the SAB has found that meeting every other month will not allow sufficient time to address the issues before it; and

WHEREAS, in order to ensure that the SAB accomplishes its mission, it has been holding special meetings to meet review timelines and address important matters; and

WHEREAS, the SAB would like to recommend that the City Council modify the currently codified meeting schedule.

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED AS FOLLOWS:

1. The SAB hereby recommends that the City Council change the current regular meeting date of the third Thursday of every other month to
_____.
2. The SAB further recommends that the City Council give it authority to modify its regular meeting dates on an as-needed basis without further City Council action.

[SIGNATURES ON FOLLOWING PAGE]

ITEM-9B

Adopted by the Surveillance Advisory Board of the City of Vallejo at a Special Meeting held on August 3, 2022 with the following vote:

AYES:

NOES:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

NAOMI YUN, CHAIR

ATTEST:

NAVEED ASHRAF, SECRETARY